
Investigation Into Vehicle Lift Faults Within DVA MOT Test Centres

DVA Action Plan – Progress Report at 31 May 2020



Executive Summary

Following faults identified in relation to vehicle lifts* in MOT Test Centres operated by the Northern Ireland (NI) Driver and Vehicle Agency (DVA), the Minister for Infrastructure, Nichola Mallon arranged the commissioning of two separate independent reviews to investigate the circumstances that gave rise to the situation and resulted in the suspension of MOT tests.

The first review was an investigation of the timeline and events that led up to the suspension of MOT tests. The NICS Group Internal Audit and Fraud Investigation Service (GIAFIS) in the Department of Finance was commissioned to complete this investigation and establish the circumstances which led to the discovery of the faults and the subsequent actions taken to communicate and resolve the matter.

The second review was carried out by an external expert to provide independent advice on the condition of the existing lifts and the steps that need to be taken to return MOT centres to a position where a full testing service could be provided. WYG Engineering (NI) Ltd were commissioned to undertake an inspection and assessment of lifts across all 15 MOT centres in Northern Ireland.

DVA welcomes the reports and their findings as it presents an opportunity to learn lessons and strengthen internal controls. The reports have identified a number of actions and arrangements that need to be put in place to minimise a reoccurrence of such events.

The DVA Action Plan and updates on progress to reflect the position at 31 May 2020 is shown at Annex A.

*The vehicle lifts are manufactured by a company called MAHA who are also contracted for their supply and maintenance.

Summary of Progress at 31 May 2020

Lift Replacement (2 of 5 actions complete)

- All lifts exhibiting signs of fatigue have been taken out of service and a replacement programme is ongoing with new lifts already installed in seven test centres.
- The requirement for an annual condition survey has been added to MAHA contract with effect from 1 April 2020 and the outcome will be verified by an independent engineer.

Contract Management (3 of 6 actions complete)

- Maintenance procedures have been confirmed and agreed with MAHA and amendments implemented with effect from 1 April 2020.
- The new contract for Independent Inspections details the requirement for thorough examinations to be completed and also provides for ad-hoc equipment surveys to be conducted.
- An additional clause has been included to strengthen the protection of DVA from additional expense should a major disruption to service ever occur again.

Inspection / Maintenance (4 of 5 actions complete)

- A contract for Independent Insurance inspections was awarded on 1 May 2020. As a result of the new contract, DVA will take ownership of the reports from the independent engineering insurance inspectors.
- Amendments to routine maintenance procedures have been agreed and implemented with effect from 1 April 2020.

Governance (2 of 3 actions complete)

- Internal processes/responsibilities have been established across various sections within the Agency, including Contract Management, Health & Safety and Operations.

Monitoring Processes (1 of 4 actions complete)

- This document forms part of the DVA's commitment to report progress in implementing the Action Plan.

DVA Action Plan – Position at 31 May 2020

ANNEX A

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
LIFT REPLACEMENT						
1. All lifts exhibiting signs of fatigue to be taken out of service.	WYG para 6.0	All lifts exhibiting signs of fatigue shall be taken out of service.	27 January 2020	COMPLETE	COMPLETE	DVA Chief Executive
2. All lifts exhibiting signs of fatigue to be replaced.	WYG para 6.0	Replace all lifts exhibiting signs of fatigue.	31 July 2020	Ongoing – new lifts installed at Newry, Cookstown, Derry, Coleraine, Larne, Mallusk and Lisburn		DVA Director of Transformation
3. Life expectancy of lifts had not been pre-determined. This potentially impacted on timing of lift replacement programme	GIAFIS para 3.12 WYG para 7.0	Agree projected life expectancy for new lifts with MAHA to inform timescale for any lift replacements.	31 July 2020	MAHA has provided an initial estimate of product life expectancy for new lifts based on a combination of factors and this is being reviewed.		DVA Director of Transformation
4. No lift replacement plan in place.	GIAFIS para 3.12	Perform an annual condition survey at appropriate point, verified by independent engineer. A replacement schedule of relevant equipment will be developed on the basis of the condition report.	01 April 2020	COMPLETE Requirement for annual condition survey added to MAHA contract with effect from 1 April 2020. The outcome of the annual condition survey will be verified by the independent engineer contract.	COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation
5. Future lift specification and design to be agreed with new equipment provider.		Agree design and specification for new lifts with WEP and conduct performance testing.	31 December 2020	The design and specification of the lift has been agreed. A prototype lift is scheduled to		SRO for Equipment Project

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
				be delivered to DVA on 27 September and will be tested to ensure that it performs in line with the design specification. If the DVA testing team identify a modification or upgrade, the contractor is obliged to make them.		
CONTRACT MANAGEMENT						
<p>1. DVA did not specify the detailed terms of reference for the condition survey report.</p> <p>Consequently, the report did not enable DVA to fully evaluate the potential outcome of future independent inspections.</p>	GIAFIS para 1.7	Ensure target dates/content and detail of reports are specified as part of the requirement for any reports/surveys commissioned in future.	Ad hoc	<p><u>COMPLETE</u></p> <p>The MAHA contract details the requirements for 8 weekly and monthly inspections to be completed and also includes option for ad hoc equipment surveys to be conducted.</p> <p>The new contract for Independent Inspections details the requirement for 6 monthly thorough examinations to be completed and also provides for ad hoc equipment surveys to be conducted.</p> <p>If ad hoc surveys are requested by DVA specific terms of</p>	COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
				reference will be agreed, with the respective contractor, including target dates for completion.		
2. Repairs had already been carried out without prior notification/approval by DVA Contract Management staff. Consequently, the integrity of the repair was not able to be assessed.	GIAFIS para 4.9	Ensure that reactive maintenance procedures are fully understood by the contractor, including that DVA Contract Management must approve all future equipment repairs before work is commissioned.	06 May 2020	COMPLETE Procedures confirmed and agreed with MAHA on 6 May 2020.	COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation
3. DVA did not specify how MAHA would categorise any faults found or the role of the independent inspectors. Consequently, the severity or impact of the identified cracks was not fully understood.	GIAFIS paras 1.7 and 4.11	Ensure requirement for categorisation of faults is specified for all future reports/surveys commissioned.	30 June 2020	Discussions initiated with new Independent Inspectors. Independent inspections will provide categorisation of faults in line with legislative standards. Any faults identified by MAHA are categorised in line with KPIs relating to priorities for fault resolution as specified within the contractual Performance Standards. Each priority reflects the nature, severity and impact of the fault, and sets a timescale for resolution.		DVA Director of Transformation
4. No timescale for repair of Category B defect was stated by the independent inspector.	GIAFIS para 4.7	Agree timescale for repairs in relation to the new contract for independent inspections	30 June 2020	Discussions held with new independent inspectors and processes agreed, including the		DVA Director of Transformation

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
				<p>need for a defined timescale for repair of each defect identified</p> <p>All faults identified by MAHA are categorised in line with KPIs relating to priorities for fault resolution as specified within the contractual Performance Standards. Each priority reflects the nature, severity and impact of the fault, and sets a timescale for resolution.</p>		
5. The maintenance schedule was not sufficiently detailed to uncover the issue of the cracked lifts.	WYG para 7.0	Ensure vehicle lift inspection process is supplemented with a more specific list of items to be inspected as part of the general inspection.	01 April 2020	<p><u>COMPLETE</u></p> <p>Amendments to routine maintenance procedures (8 weekly and 6 monthly) have been agreed and implemented with effect from 1 April 2020. These include additional requirements for inspection of vehicle lifts.</p>	COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation
6. DVA Vehicle Testing Equipment Maintenance Contract includes limited cover for contractor performance/ liability issues.		Review existing contractor performance/liability clauses within the DVA Vehicle Testing Equipment Contract to assess whether these can be strengthened.	30 June 2020	<p><u>PARTIALLY COMPLETE</u></p> <p>An additional clause has been included in the contract to strengthen the protection of DVA from additional expense</p>	PARTIALLY COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
				<p>should a major disruption to service ever occur again.</p> <p>Ability to amend liability value included in contract under consideration.</p>		
INSPECTION / MAINTENANCE						
<p>1. Independent engineering insurance inspections were managed by MAHA through existing contract, which was perceived as a potential conflict of interest.</p>	<p>GIAFIS para 1.2</p>	<p>DVA to appoint independent engineering insurance inspectors to conduct thorough examination inspections of relevant equipment in test centres.</p>	<p>01 May 2020</p>	<p><u>COMPLETE</u></p> <p>Contract for Independent Insurance inspections procured and awarded on 1 May. Independent inspections removed from MAHA contract 30 April. Internal processes/ responsibilities currently being established with CMP, H&S and Operations. Discussions initiated with new contractor, including roles/responsibilities and communication protocols.</p>	COMPLETE	<p>DVA Director of Transformation</p>
<p>2. There were no cycle counters fitted to lifts to record number of lift cycles to inform a decision on life expectancy.</p>	<p>WYG para 7.0</p>	<p>Consider feasibility of adding cycle counters to all lifts.</p>	<p>30 June 2020</p>	<p>Feasibility of cycle counters currently being explored with MAHA.</p>		<p>DVA Director of Transformation</p>

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
3. Inspection process may not have been sufficiently aligned to vehicle lift usage.	WYG para 7.0	Develop revised inspection process based on the vehicle lift usage.	01 April 2020	<u>COMPLETE</u> Amendments to routine maintenance procedures (8 weekly and 6 monthly) have been agreed and implemented with effect from 1 April 2020, based on manufacturer's recommendation and operating instructions.	COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation
4. Cracks were identified in lifts during a thorough examination inspection but there was no record within DVA that a Serious Defect Report was provided at the time.	GIAFIS para 4.3	All future inspection and defect reports shall be provided to DVA on completion of a thorough examination inspection to ensure repairs are carried out within recommended timescales.	01 May 2020	<u>COMPLETE</u> As a result of the new contract, DVA will take ownership of the reports from the independent engineering insurance inspectors. New procedures will ensure defects are notified and repairs effected on a timely basis.	COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation
5. WYG recommended that the general inspection of each lift should include an inspection by a Structural Engineer.	WYG para 7.0	Ensure inspection of equipment, including lifts, is completed by a suitably qualified engineer.	01 April 2020	<u>COMPLETE</u> Amendments to routine maintenance procedures (8 weekly and 6 monthly) have been agreed and implemented with effect from 1 April 2020. These include additional requirements for inspection of vehicle lifts. Routine	COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
				maintenance will be carried out by fully qualified MAHA engineers.		
GOVERNANCE						
1. DVA Health and Safety and Contract Management Roles and responsibilities not clearly defined.	GIAFIS paras 4.10 to 4.12	Clarify roles and responsibilities between DVA Health and Safety and DVA Contract Management	31 May 2020	COMPLETE Internal processes/ responsibilities established with CMP, H&S and Operations. Discussions initiated with new contractor, including roles/responsibilities and communication protocols.	COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation
		Consider whether the Health and Safety team and Contract Management responsibilities should rest with a single Director or Grade 7 within DVA.	31 May 2020	COMPLETE The H&S function will move into the Directorate responsible for Contract Management with effect from 1 June 2020.		DVA Chief Executive
2. Throughout the investigation process there were a number of instances where key discussions and key decisions were not formally documented.	GIAFIS para 1.14	Ensure proper procedures are in place to record key decisions and key meetings.	20 April 2020	COMPLETE Confirmation that arrangements are in place to properly record all key decisions and key meetings. Communication issued to all	COMPLETE	DVA Chief Executive and All Directors

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
				business areas.		
3. Review DVA business continuity plans to take account of lessons learned from lift issues.		DVA Business Continuity Plans shall be reviewed and revised to take account of lessons learned from lift issues.	30 September 2020			DVA Chief Executive and All Directors
MONITORING PROCESSES						
1. Investigation report and the DVA Chief Executive's response to the Permanent Secretary's memo of 7 April be provided to the DVA Audit and Risk Assurance Committee		Provide copy of NICS GIAFIS Investigation report to DVA Audit and Risk Assurance Committee	09 April 2020	COMPLETE Chief Executive confirmed that the report was provided to Audit Committee members on 9 April and he briefed the Audit Committee Chair on same day. A copy of the memo and this response will also be copied to Audit Committee members.	COMPLETE	DVA Chief Executive
2. Implementing DVA Action Plan		Implementation of DVA Action plan shall be monitored by DVA Audit Committee	DVA Audit Committee Meetings			DVA Audit Committee Chair
3. Reporting progress in implementing Action Plan		Monthly reporting of progress in implementing Action Plan to the Permanent Secretary and the Minister	05 June 2020 (and monthly thereafter)			DVA Chief Executive
4. DVA Internal Audit Plan for 2020-21		Validation of actions in this Action Plan will be included in DVA Internal Audit Plan for 2020-21 and reported to DVA Audit and Risk Committee.	30 June 2020			DVA Chief Executive